

Open letter to European policymakers: The Greek crisis is a European crisis and needs European solutions beyond emergency packages

Launched in May 2010 by:

Prof. Philip Arestis (University of Cambridge)

Prof. Gustav A. Horn (IMK at Hans Böckler Foundation)

and signed by 187 persons, primarily European economists and social scientists

In a dramatic late-night initiative European policymakers have erected a protective shield against further speculative attacks against individual member states and the euro area as a whole. This was necessary, but also long overdue and, most importantly, it is not enough on its own. Alongside short-term measures to stabilise the markets a medium-term program to revitalise the real economy is needed: only a return to economic growth *throughout* the euro area can ensure that debts will be repaid and sustainable fiscal consolidation will be achieved.

For weeks the attention of the financial markets, media commentators and policymakers has been focused on the Greek crisis. The Greek population is being asked to make painful cuts which will only depress incomes, output and employment further, even as interest rates are driven up to crippling levels. Most recently its bonds have been declared 'junk' by rating agencies, which, the damaged credibility of such agencies notwithstanding, threatens to have disastrous knock-on effects. This is a disaster for Greeks, but it is also profoundly the wrong course for Europe as a whole, which needs to chart a European path out of the crisis.

We are appalled that European policymaking has systematically lagged behind events, allowing itself to be driven by volatile market sentiments, populist politicians and a media that all too often exhibits fundamental ignorance about the issues. This has dramatically raised the costs and risks of resolving the crisis.

Greece's fiscal catastrophe has four causes. First, there is the past fiscal weakness of the Greek state, in particular the inability to generate tax revenues, as a share of GDP, in line with its European neighbours, but also inexcusable statistical manipulation. Second, Greece's relative competitiveness has steadily worsened, especially within the euro area, as reflected in a sustained current account deficit as a result of above-average increases in unit labour costs and prices and a stronger economic growth dynamic. Third the economic crisis – which, given the country's conservative banking sector, was a classic external shock – has ravaged public finances, just as in other countries. And last but not least, fourth, the interest cost burden has dramatically increased, as genuine concerns about fiscal sustainability combined with speculation and misinformation to dramatically raise the rate of interest on new Greek government bonds.

Only the first of these reasons calls unambiguously for Greeks to accept the pain of fiscal austerity. All the others have a strong European dimension and call for European solutions. In particular, the loss of competitiveness by Greece (and a number of other countries, including Spain and Ireland) is the mirror image of an increase in relative competitiveness by others, notably Germany, Austria and the Netherlands. In addition the latter countries could not have increased their net exports without the faster demand expansion in the former group, which, it is often forgotten, were also responsible for much of Europe's economic and jobs growth in recent years, while demand and output growth in the surplus countries has been sluggish. The problem is symmetrical and the solution must be as well.

For Greece has not – as is often claimed or implied – lagged behind Germany in raising productivity: on the contrary hourly labour productivity increased more than twice as fast in Greece than in Germany during the ten years of the euro since 1999. Nor do frequent claims in

the media of Greek 'laziness' stand up to scrutiny: average annual working hours are the longest in Europe (and hundreds of hours per year longer than in Germany!). The problem has been with nominal wage and price setting.

Due to strong differences in wage setting, Greek nominal unit labour costs increased by more than 30% since the start of EMU – and the increases in Italy, Spain, Portugal and Ireland were even higher – whereas in Germany they rose by just 8%. Monopolistic price setting is also critical, enabling firms to pass on higher wage costs or imported prices onto domestic prices. Such wage and price divergences are not sustainable within a monetary union where exchange-rate adjustments are no longer possible. But this requires an adjustment from both ends. Wages and prices in Greece and other countries need to fall in relative terms, but they must increase faster in Germany, whose aggressive wage moderation policies are deflationary, dampen domestic demand, export unemployment and threaten to explode the monetary union. This is the only way to rebalance the euro area while avoiding the huge risk of a deflationary spiral.

Misunderstanding these causes, European policymakers have fiddled while Greece has burned. Monetary policy was for too long left out of the discussion. Fiscal support offers have for too long been too little, too late and subject to unreasonable conditions. The EU2020 Guidelines proposed by the Commission do recognize the imbalances problem, but the proposed measures are not symmetrical. As a result speculators have driven the cost of resolving the crisis higher and higher. Lending public money to Greece, at interest, is not charity. It is a recognition of the interconnections of a monetary union and in the vital interest of all Europeans. No-one benefits from Greece and other countries embarking on massive fiscal austerity, demand deflation and competitive price deflation. This is all the more so when monetary policy is up against the zero bound and the European economy as a whole still dependent on policy stimulus. Greece must not be forced into massive demand deflation: having avoided the mistakes of the Great Depression at European level it makes no sense to repeat them at national level.

On the contrary it is in Europe's vital interests to resolve the Greek crisis on the basis of rising incomes across the continent and to put in place the needed machinery to cope with competitive and fiscal imbalances in the future. The future of the euro area as a whole is at stake. There is a serious risk of a falling Greek domino knocking over a series of other countries. Portugal and other countries now stand where Greece was a few months ago: it was this fear that belatedly provoked European policymakers to act. The economic, political and social costs would be enormous. Has Europe learnt nothing from the 1920s when Germany was, in many ways, in a similar situation to Greece today? Prevented from raising exports to service its foreign debt (reparations) by mercantilist policies, Germany embarked on a disastrous course of deflation and depression which paved the way for the horrors that followed. Today as then, deficit countries cannot simply save their way out of crisis, they must have the opportunity to grow their way out. And this is also the only way to limit the damage to surplus countries, who are otherwise also destined to lose out in terms of growth, employment and financial stability.

In addition to Euro area governments' belated commitment to meet Greece's needs to restructure its sovereign bonds for a three-year period and the recent commitment to issue Eurobonds, with a role for central bank purchases on the secondary market, we call for a coordinated economic policy response around the following elements:

- The ECB must provide as much support as possible to the fiscal consolidation and rebalancing effort. In the short run that means committing to maintaining its base rates close to zero. Keeping interest rates low is vital to help minimise refinancing costs while pushing up the rate of nominal GDP growth. As recently announced, it must continue to accept Greek bonds as collateral. The extent of central bank bond purchases needs to be clarified.
- As part of Greece's commitment to accept enhanced supervision of its public finances, a fiscal consolidation package is required that is longer-term in orientation and designed to

have as limited negative effects on demand as possible in the short run (notably drastically reducing tax evasion), but primary fiscal surpluses in the medium run, Greece should couple this with a negotiated, time-limited freeze on wages and administered prices and policies to increase product market competition.

- Germany, Austria and other surplus countries commit to maintain fiscal stimulus and a period of faster-than-productivity-growth wage increases; more generally, fiscal exit strategies should be coordinated within the Council to underpin area-wide economic recovery while rebalancing demand within the currency area. This requires asynchronous exit strategies. Greece and other deficit countries have to employ them earlier while the surplus countries like Germany follow later on. After the adjustment period wage policies should return to an orientation to the medium-run growth of national productivity plus the ECB's inflation target in all countries.
- Last but not least, the EU should embark on an immediate review of its various policy coordination mechanisms with a view to strengthening them and refocusing them in the direction revealed to be necessary by the crisis, namely: a symmetrical focus on surplus and deficit countries; the monitoring of private debt-savings dynamics, rather than just the public sector, and thus a focus on current account positions; incorporating wage and price setting and accordingly strengthening the role of social partners. A starting point is the proposed EU2020 Guidelines which need to be revised accordingly.

The Greek crisis is a chance to drive European integration forward to the benefit of all Europe's citizens. But current policies, based on misperceptions of economic interlinkages and short-sighted and erroneous views on 'national' interests, must not be allowed to destroy the monetary union, set back European integration and imperil its economic and political future. EMU simply cannot go on like this. We call on European policymakers to find European solutions that serve the interest of all Europe's citizens.

Signees (until 05/18/2010):

Alexiou	Constantinos	ARISTOTELIAN UNIVERSITY OF THESSALONIKI	THESSALONIKI
Andersson	Jean	Attac and Tax Justice Network	ST. HELIER JE2 3LF
Appelbaum	Eileen	Rutgers University	NEW BRUNSWICK, NJ 08901
Arestis	Philip	University of Cambridge	CAMBRIDGE
Argeitis	Giorgios	University of Athens	ATHENS
Arriola Palomares	Joaquín	Universidad del Pais Vasco	BILBAO
Asteriou	Dimitrios	Hellenic Open University	Patras
Auerback	Marshall	The New School, The Roosevelt Institute	
Bartel	Rainer	University of Linz	LINZ
Baum	Josef	Universität Wien	VIENNA
Bayer	Kurt	European Bank for Reconstruction and Development	LONDON EC2A3EE
Bergstrom	Villy	Villy Bergstrom	UPPSALA
Bernardo	Luis	Louis Bernardo	LISBON
Biasco	Salvatore	UNIVERSITE ROMA "SAPIENZA"	ROMA
Bischoff	Joachim	VSA-Verlag	HAMBURG
Bochum	Ulrich	G-IBS	Berlin
Bögenhold	Dieter	FREE UNIVERSITY OF BOLZANO	BOLZANO
Bohle	Dorothee	Central European University	BUDAPEST
Bömer	Hermann	Technische Universität Dortmund	Dortmund
Böök	Mikael	Network Institute for Global Democratization	ISNAES
Brana	Francisco-Javier	Universidad de Salamanca	SALAMANCA
Bustillo	Ricardo	Universidad del Pais Vasco	BILBAO
Caravelis	Georges	European Parliament	BRUSSELS
Cesaratto	Sergio	Universita degli Studi di Siena	Siena
Chamchiev	Tchinguiz	University of Grenoble	
Ciancanelli	Penelope	University of Strathclyde	GLASGOW
Collignon	Stefan	Sant'Anna School of Advanced Studies	PISA
Cordonnier	Laurent	Université Lille 1	VILLENEUVE D'ASCQ CEDEX
Costabile	Lilia	Università di Napoli Federico II	Napoli
Cuerpo Carrera	Antonio	Antonio Cuerpo Carrera	
Czeskleba-Dupont	Rolf	Roskilde University	ROSKILDE
Dafermos	Yannis	University of Athens	ATHENS
Dallery	Thomas	Université Lille 1	VILLENEUVE D'ASCQ CEDEX
De Bruijn	Koos	Jubilee Nederland	AMSTERDAM
De Masi	Fabio	De Masi	
De Rossa	Proinsias	European Parliament	BRUXELLES
Deml	Jörg	Jörg Deml	
Detje	Richard	VSA-Verlag	HAMBURG
Dier	Gerhard	Dier	NANZDIETSCHWEILER
Dobusch	Leonhard	FU BERLIN	BERLIN
Dorman	Peter	Evergreen State College	OLYMPIA, WA
Dullien	Sebastian	HTW BERLIN	BERLIN
Eckert	Martin	ISPA - Institut für Sozialwissenschaftliche Praxis	Berlin
Edwards	Michael	University College	LONDON
Eloire	Fabien	Université Lille 1	VILLENEUVE D'ASCQ CEDEX
Elsner	Wolfram	Universität Bremen	BREMEN
Erhard	Peter	Universität Bremen	BREMEN
Evans	Trevor	Berlin School of Economics and Law	BERLIN
Ewald	Stephan	Stephan Ewald	
Fayolle	Jacky	SECAFI	PARIS
Febrero	Eladio	University of Castilla-La Mancha	Cuenca
Feijo	Carmem	Fluminense Federal University	
Fernández Steinko	Armando	Universidad Complutense de Madrid	MADRID
Fisch	Marion	VSA-Verlag	HAMBURG
Flassbeck	Heiner	UNCTAD	GENEVA 10
Forges Davanzati	Guglielmo	University of Salento	
Frangakis	Marica	Nicos Poulantzas Institute	ATHENS
Friedrich	Gerhard	Universita degli Studi di Torino	TORINO
Gadrey	Jean	Univ. des Sciences & Technologies / Lastree	VILLENEUVE D'ASCQ CEDEX
Galgoczi	Béla	ETUI	BRUSSELS
Garcia-Arias	Jorge	University of Leon	Leon
Gläser	Cyril	UNIVERSITÄT KÖLN	KÖLN
Gobbe	François	Kairos Europe	BRUXELLES
Gough	Ian	London School of Economics	LONDON
Grunert	Günther	BBS Osnabrück am Pottgraben	
Gurtner	Bruno	Tax Justice Network	BERN
Hakelberg	Sebastian	Hakelberg	
Hall	Wayne	Capodistrias-Spinelli-Europe Initiative	ATHENS
Haluszka	Jan	Haluszka	MÜNCHEN
Harcourt	Geoffrey	University of Cambridge	CAMBRIDGE
Haug	Wolfgang Fritz	Berliner Institut für kritische Theorie	BERLIN

Hauser	Michael	Universität Wien	VIENNA
Hein	Eckhard	Hochschule für Wirtschaft und Recht Berlin	BERLIN
Hoffer	Frank	ILO - BIT	GENEVA 22
Höhn	Hilmar	Industriegewerkschaft Bergbau, Chemie, Energie	Berlin
Holland	Stuart	UNIVERSIDADE DE COIMBRA	COIMBRA
Horn	Gustav	IMK bei der HBS	DÜSSELDORF
Hyman	Richard	London School of Economics	LONDON
Ismail		Manchester Business School	MANCHESTER
Jäger	Johannes	University of Applied Sciences BFI Vienna	Wien
Jaworski	Jascha	Jascha Jaworski	KRONSHAGEN
Jessop	Robert	Lancaster University	BISPHAM BLACKPOOL LANCASHIRE
Kaltenbrunner	Anina	SOAS	LONDON
Kapeller	Jakob	University of Linz	LINZ
Karanikolas	Pavlos	Agricultural University of Athens	ATHENS
Kelton	Stephanie	University of Missouri - Kansas City	KANSAS CITY
Kip	Markus	YORK UNIVERSITY	TORONTO
Kisker	Klaus Peter	Klaus Peter Kisker	BERLIN
Kloss	Oliver	VER.DI BUNDESVERWALTUNG	LEIPZIG
Koratzanis	Athanasios	University of Crete	
Kronenberg	Tobias	Forschungszentrum Jülich	JÜLICH
Landesmann	Michael	WIIW	Linz and Vienna
Lehto	Eero	Labour Institute for Economic Research	HELSINKI
Lieber	Christoph	VSA-Verlag	HAMBURG
Lucas	Pat	Attac and Tax Justice Network	ST. HELIER JE2 3LF
Lüdemann	Meike	Meike Lüdemann	
Madrick	Jeff	The New School, The Roosevelt Institute	
Malagón	Eduardo	Université du Pays Basque	LEIOA
Marterbauer	Markus	WIFO	WIEN
Méaulle	Matthieu	Foundation for European Progressive Studies	BRUSSELS
Meditich	Ulrich	Ulrich Meditsch	Duisburg
Metzger	Martina	BIF - Berliner Institut für Finanzmarktforschung	Berlin
Militello	Giacinto	Rivista Argomenti Umani	ROMA
Mohanty	Mritiunjoy	Indian Institute of Management Calcutta	
Mohun	Simon	Queen Mary University of London	LONDON
Molina-Gallart	Nuria	EURODAD	BRUXELLS
Monastiriotis	Vassilis	London School of Economics	LONDON
Mosler	Warren	The New School, The Roosevelt Institute	
Müller	Albrecht	Nachdenkseiten	Pleisweiler
Müller	Bernhard	VSA-Verlag	HAMBURG
Murphy	Richard	Tax Research LLP	NORFOLK PE38 9LJ
Niechoj	Thorsten	IMK bei der HBS	DÜSSELDORF
Nikolopoulos	Andreas	AUEB	ATHENS
Nikonoff	Jacques	Nikonoff	
Oetsch	Walter	University of Linz	LINZ
Oreiro	José Luis	Universidade de Brasilia	Brasilia-DF.
Palley	Thomas	New America Foundation	WASHINGTON DC 20009
Palmieri	Stefano	IRES CGIL	ROMA
Passadakis	Alexis	Attac Germany	
Pennacchi	Laura	Fondazione Basso	Roma
Pernicka	Susan	Universität Wien	VIENNA
Perri	Stefano	Università di Macerata	Macerata
Pettifor	Ann	New Economics Foundation	LONDON
Pianta	Mario	University of Urbino	URBINO
Picciotto	Sol	Antigua Universidad	Gipuzkoa
Picek	Oliver	Oliver Picek	
Pickshaus	Klaus	IG METALL	FRANKFURT AM MAIN
Pitelis	Christos	Judge Institute of Management Studies	CAMBRIDGE
Plaschke	Henrik	Aalborg University	AALBORG
Pope	Robin	Bonn University	BONN
Preissl	Birgitte	Preissl	
Ramazzotti	Paolo	Università di Macerata	Macerata
Ramos	José	José Ramos	
Raza	Werner	Fachhochschule des bfi Wien	WIEN
Regan	Aidan	University College Dublin	DUBLIN 4
Rehm	Miriam	The New School for Social Research	
Riemann	Siegfried	Riemann	BRUCHKÖBEL
Riese	Martin	University of Linz	LINZ
Rietzler	Katja	Rietzler Economics	BERLIN
Rima	Ingrid	Temple University	PHILADELPHIA PA19122
Rodríguez González	Carlos	Universidad del Pais Vasco	BILBAO
Roncaglia	Alessandro	UNIVERSITE ROMA "SAPIENZA"	ROMA

Rosato	Laura Elisa	Rosato	ANCONA
Roszbach	Uwe	Arbeit und Leben Thüringen	ERFURT
Rossi	Sergio	University of Fribourg	FRIBOURG
Roumelioti	Maria-Eleni	University of Pittsburg	
Sainz-Pardo Santos	Esther	STES-Intersindical	MADRID
Salvado	Susana	Salvado	LISBON
Sawyer	Malcolm	University of Leeds	LEEDS
Schettkat	Ronald	Bergische Universität Wuppertal	WUPPERTAL
Schieder	Werner	Deutscher Bundestag	BERLIN
Schieder	Timm	SPD	ERFURT
Schild	Armin	IG METALL	FRANKFURT AM MAIN
Schmidt	Johannes	Baden-Württemberg Cooperative State University	Mosbach
Schneider	Nicolai	VER.DI BUNDESVERWALTUNG	BERLIN
Schoenpflug	Karin	Universität Wien	VIENNA
Schuetz	Walther	OEIE-Kaernten	VILLACH
Schui	Herbert	Schui	BUCHHOLZ
Scott Cato	Molly	UWIC	CARDIFF
Setterfield	Mark	Trinity College Hartford	Hartford
Siebecke	Gerd	VSA-Verlag	HAMBURG
Singh-Muchelle	Arjun	London School of Economics	London
Solari	Stefano	Universita di Padova - Dipart scienze economiche	PADOVA
Sousa	Rodolfo	CFPM	LISBON
Sterkel	Gabriele	VER.DI BUNDESVERWALTUNG	BERLIN
Sterpis	Ioannis	University of Athens	ATHENS
Stockhammer	Engelbert	Kingston University	KINGSTON KT2 7LB
Taft	Michael	UNITE the Union	Dublin 3
Theodoropoulou	Sotiria	European Policy Centre	BRUXELLES
Thomasberger	Claus	HTW BERLIN	BERLIN
Toporowski	Jan	University London-School Oriental & African Studie	LONDON
Tricarico	Antonio	CRBM	
Truger	Achim	IMK bei der HBS	DÜSSELDORF
Urban	Hans-Jürgen	IG METALL	FRANKFURT AM MAIN
van Treeck	Till	IMK bei der HBS	DÜSSELDORF
Vandavelde	Franck	Université Lille 1	VILLENEUVE D'ASCQ CEDEX
Veneziani	Roberto	Queen Mary University of London	LONDON
Vitols	Sigurt	WZB	BERLIN
Volz	Joachim	Joachim Volz	
von Arnim	Rudiger	University of Utah - Dept of Economics	SALT LAKE CITY
Warleigh-Lack	Alex	BRUNEL UNIVERSITY	UXBRIDGE
Watt	Andrew	ETUI	BRUSSELS
Weiler	Ulrike	Weiler	STUTTGART
Werner	Alban	Die Linke	Aachen
Winkolewski	Ulrich	Winkolewski	ST. KATHARINENE OT HESSELN
Wöhl	Stefanie	Universität Wien	VIENNA
Yildiz	Bunyamin	Bunyamin Yildiz	